

Transposed?
Concert (c)
Score?

TITLE

Composer

b. 19__

Presto

Andante

Flute 1-2

Oboe 1-2

Clarinet in B \flat 1-2

Bassoon 1-2

F-horn goes ABOVE bassoon.

Horn in F1 1-2

Check Spelling

Extend **ff**
Bracket down

use quarter rest

Dynamics?

use whole rest

Add a space between numbers

Cl. can cover the A

Dynamics?

The bassoon should go up to F# to finish the gesture. No, it's not too high.

ff
Align

p

p

4

Fl.

* Blockish

Ob.

Give to Ob. 1

Cl.

This is okay, however it seems a little out of place

Bsn.

Hn.

* If you're building up energy or developing the piece, add or double the line!

7

Fl.

Ob.

Cl.

Bsn.

Hn.

So empty...

So empty...

Missing BASS part in piano L.H.

Why'd the line just stop?

NEXT PAGE →

10

Fl.

Ob.

Cl.

Bsn.

Hn.

Dynamic?

Check rests

- NOTES -

Not a bad start to this piano arrangement! To keep it simple, I am compiling my comments into a page or two for simplicity. It was my goal to treat this work with an outside opinion of the same caliber as I would with my peers.

Before the main comments, I wish to acknowledge the fact that it is in the early stages of arranging and I understand you do not expect this to be anywhere near the final result. I read your concerns on the YCF post and based on the information, I did a brief analysis over a super detailed scholarly one as this is not a completed work.

First and foremost, I wish to state my biggest critique: It already sounds and looks “blockish”. As in, there are groups of instruments playing in distinct blocks versus smooth connections or conversations. Between measure (mm.) 4 and 5, I used a purple pen to notate the blocks between the clarinet and oboe. This is a concern to me as now; you’ve made the music too vertical versus horizontal. We just started the work and having it sound blockish over 3-minutes will make the arrangement cast an awkward feeling for both the performers and audience. Following these comments (and on YCF), I have attached my version of the beginning of the work.

Already, I am using the ensemble to create a smooth overlap and conversation. Instead of creating distinct barriers between the gestures from the piano part, I overlap the ends of gestures so the ear can pick up a new sound and continue to hear it smoothly. On this topic, another note I have is to be clear in the roles of the instruments. You may be able to have some cool moments balancing the registers, however, if you want to capture the bass voices in the piano, that only leaves Bassoon and F Horn to do that task while the upper woodwinds carry the melody to start. Visually, compared to my example PDF, you can tell which instruments are melodic and accompaniment before hearing it.

[NEXT PAGE]

In terms of your raw writing and woodwind playability, it's been fine so far. Some of your engraving (ex. 8th and 16th note beaming) would make it harder for performers to understand, especially youth ensembles. If you are writing for two distinct instruments, as you clarified Clarinets 1 AND 2, then show it with the beaming/ stem direction.

I play bassoon as well and in the few quintets I have done, we have received individual parts versus a full score. I have seen one score with tiny staves to see each other's part, but that is less common. So, for the score, make the parts distinct by using the correct stem direction and note beaming.

Lastly, you have some spelling and layout mistakes. On the score, the F-horn should go in-between the clarinet and bassoon, not under bassoon. Before you finalize the copy, consider adding the title fields, original composer, you as the arranger and copyright watermark for protection. This feels obvious, so please forgive me if this is the goal, and if you are not at that step in the writing process. On YCF, you misspelled the name of the composer: **Max Reger**, not *Max Meger*.

Outside of these comments, and those of which I have annotated on the score, I do not have anything else to point out or comment upon.

Keep up the good work and let us know when you complete the arrangement. I know if I had this in Highschool or early University, my friends would have easily played a little dance such as this!

NEXT
PAGE 

Sincerely,



Humoreske no.2

Concert Score

For Woodwind Quintet

Max Reger, Op.20
(1873 - 1916)

Presto **Andante**

Flutes [1-2] *f* *mf* * Notice the overlap

Oboes [1-2] *f* *mf* *p* * Notice the overlap

Clarinets in Bb [1-2] *f* *p* *mf*

Horns in F [1-2] *f* *p* Accompaniment

Bassoons [1-2] *f* *p*